AUDIT COMMITTEE OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK

MINUTES OF THE AUDIT COMMITTEE MEETING

WEDNESDAY, October 22, 2014 IN THE COMPTROLLER'S OFFICE BOARD ROOM

ATTENDANCE

Chair Bernard Rosen

Private Members Mark Kaplan

Bud Larson Michael Spitzer

Public Members Representing the Mayor – John Grathwol

Representing the Comptroller – Michele Mark Levine Representing the Public Advocate – Lawrence Schimmel

Interim Secretary Katrina Stauffer

Independent

Auditors Deloitte & Touche LLP - James Curry, Glenn Friedrich, Mike Malloy, Bogdan

Geambasu, Ira Kastrinsky, Darshan Patel

Others New York City Office of Management & Budget – Nicole Fleming, Enid Ellis

New York City Office of the Actuary – John Gibney

New York City Mayor's Office of Operations - Florim Ardolli, George Davis

New York City Comptroller's Office – Camille Arezzo, Nancy Brunner, Susan Cornwall, Leonel Ferreira, David Jeter, Thema Holder, Patricia Kearns, Carol Kostik, Berta Lara, Veronika Musheyeva, Maria Nicola, Joan Stapleton, Marina

Verba, Karen Yang

New York City Public Advocate's Office – Barbara Sherman

New York City Law Department – Sharon Cantor, Steve Cushman, Amber Thiel

Department of Education – Marc Alterman, Bill Goldband, Michael Hadaway,

Suzette Irish, Robert Parlato, John Wall, Marisol Williams

Audit Committee Meeting – October 22, 2014

I. Chair of the Audit Committee

Due to Mr. Bernard Rosen, the Chair, being slightly delayed, Mr. Mark Kaplan called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. Roll call was taken, and a quorum was present.

II. Secretary of the Audit Committee

The first agenda item was the appointment of as interim Audit Committee Secretary, due to Ms. Jacqueline Thompson's temporary absence. Mr. Bud Larson introduced a motion nominating Ms. Katrina Stauffer to serve as interim Audit Committee Secretary. A vote was taken and Ms. Stauffer was unanimously elected.

III. Review of the Draft Minutes of the Audit Committee Held August 6, 2014

Mr. Bernard Rosen resumed his responsibility as Chair at the beginning of the next agenda item, which was the approval of the draft minutes of the August 6th, 2014, Committee meeting. The Chair inquired if there were any comments on the draft minutes as presented, subject to editorial comments submitted to the interim Committee Secretary; no further comments were presented. Mr. Mark Kaplan introduced a motion to approve the minutes. Mr. Larry Schimmel seconded the motion. A vote was taken, and the motion carried.

October 22, 2014

IV. Adopt a Resolution for Maria Tavares

Ms. Michele Levine introduced a motion that the Audit Committee thank and commend Maria Tavares for her dedicated service to the Committee and the City and wish her all the best in her future endeavors. Mr. Mark Kaplan and Mr. Bud Larson seconded the motion. A vote was taken, and the motion carried unanimously.

V. Executive Session

The Chair asked if any members wished to bring up new business for the public meeting at this time. No new business was raised.

The Chair asked for a motion for the Committee to enter the Executive Session to consult with legal counsel and discuss non-public financial. The motion was made by Mr. Kaplan and seconded by Mr. Spitzer; the vote was noted as unanimous, and the Committee went into Executive Session.

VI. Return to Public Session: Works Requested by Deloitte

Following the Executive Session, +the Committee returned to public session. A motion was introduced by Ms. Levine and seconded to table the vote on the work that has been requested by EDC and DEP in order to have opportunity to get more information.

A motion was introduced and seconded to approve the requests for DOE compliance reporting on the Courageous Principals program, the Manhattan Assistant District Attorney Assistance program, and the Community School of Social Justice program. Ms. Levine, Mr. Schimmel and Mr. Grathwol abstained, but a vote was taken and the motion carried.

October 22, 2014

There being no further business before the Committee, the Chair adjourned until the next scheduled meeting on October 27, 2014 at 12:30 p.m.

October 22, 2014